



## **Interregional ESF – ARCANE**

### **'Levant and Eastern Mediterranean' Regional Meeting Durham University 24<sup>th</sup>-26<sup>th</sup> March 2011**

#### **Final Report**

Organizer: Prof Graham Philip, Dept. of Archaeology, Durham University

This was the third of four meetings to be held within the “Interregional Phase” of the ARCANE Project. The groups concerned are those working on the western part of the area of interest of the ARCANE project: Southern Levant (SL), Northern Levant (NL), Cyprus (CY), Western Anatolia (WA), Middle Euphrates (ME). The latter group provides the vital spatial connection between the Levant and the Eastern Mediterranean and the other Interregional groups.

#### **Summary of Main Items Discussed**

The main aims of the 'Levant and Eastern Mediterranean' Regional Meeting were to review the work of the Topic Coordinators, to identify correlations and address any contradictions between the various regional sequences, in order to reach a general intraregional account which will form the basis of a draft for the publication of the regional syntheses.

#### **Session I: Presentations by Regional Teams**

Representatives of each of the five regional groups presented the results obtained from the regional meetings and their conclusions as to the most appropriate material culture sequence for the third millennium BC in that area. Each team provided a review of the state of affairs in that region with respect to data collection and analysis, and presented an overview of the chronological development of material culture within the regional sequence.

Miroschedji and Greenberg discussed whether the data from the Southern Levant could most usefully be represented by a ESL sequence using six, or seven, distinct

phases. A decision was made to use seven phases, including an ESL5a and ESL5b. It was also observed, that on the evidence of recent radiocarbon dates, the ESL6 (equivalent to the previous local Early Bronze IV), appeared to begin rather earlier than has traditionally been believed. Period ESL5a, was suggested to begin as early as 29/2800 BC, again earlier than conventional wisdom would place it. This change has significant implications for the correlation between different regional sequences. Sowada discussed the status of connections between the Levant and Egypt in the light of recent radiocarbon dates from Egypt, and observed that the resulting modifications to the Egyptian chronology appeared consistent with the dating sequence suggested by the radiometric evidence from the ESL.

The two presentations on the Northern Levant confirmed the existence of two substantially different sequences for the coastal (ENLc) and inland (ENLi) regions. While Thalmann demonstrated that the 3<sup>rd</sup> millennium BC sequence for the coastal region is now much clearer than was the case even a few years ago, Philip explained that information on periods ENLi1-4 remains scant, although work is underway to provide an inventory from the unpublished excavations at Tell Nebi Mend which appear to cover part of this sequence. Using information supplied by Lisa Cooper, Philip was able to demonstrate that the ceramic developments for ENLi5-6 are now becoming clearer. However, correlations between the ENLc and ENLi sequences remain difficult, because material-culture parallels, and radiometric dates, are both scant and poorly understood.

Peltenburg, Bolger and Papaconstantinou presented the ceramic and architectural evidence for Cyprus and confirmed that a five stage ECY sequence appears to suit developments on the island. The insular nature of much of the Cypriot record was very clear, in particular the occurrence of anthropomorphic ceramic forms, although a few specific forms appear to have links to central and western Anatolia. The difficulty of dealing with a situation in which much of the best material comes from cemeteries rather than settlements, and in which radiocarbon dates are spread unevenly in geographical terms was emphasized.

Felli, Sconzo and Sakal presented a range of data which confirmed that the six-phase Early Middle Euphrates sequence is now well established, in no small part because of it draws upon material from numerous rescue excavations undertaken in advance of dam construction in recent years. The presentation confirmed that the ME region provides the key link between sequences in the Levant and Eastern Mediterranean Regions, and those the Jezira and Mesopotamia the east.

The WA team indicated that while the relevant sites are scattered over an extensive area, there does exist sufficient material (including a key sequence at Liman Tepe) to support combining the evidence from west and central Anatolia to form a single group. They confirmed that a number of colleagues had indicated their willingness to provide material. While work is not as far advanced in this region as in many others, the team were confident that they could complete their work by 2013, i.e. within the

overall timescale of the project. The evidence of public buildings and fortifications, material culture items associated with drinking, and weapons and items of personal adornment appear likely to provide good connections with the ENL and EME sequences. The participants at the meeting were particularly impressed by the energy with which the WA group had set about the task, despite starting rather later than others.

## **Session II: Transversal Themes**

The radiocarbon evidence from the southern Levant, presented by Boaretto appeared to confirm the general outline of the ESL sequence, and to be broadly consistent with dates from key sites in the NL region. Lebeau presented a set of recently released dates from Ebla, which appeared to suggest the destruction of Palace G (ENLi5) should be attributed to Sargon rather than Naram Sin. Lebeau also suggested that the Ebla destruction was likely to have been contemporaneous with that of Mari Ville 2. Several participants remarked that considerable caution was required in assessing the dates provided by the Ebla team, as the data supplied lacked key information on the stratigraphic contexts of the samples and nature of the material sampled.

## **Session III Discussion of key issues arising from regional presentations**

The EA-EL-EM synoptic table was presented by Lebeau. This was agreed subject to minor changes in matter of presentation.

## **Session IV Discussion of Publication issues**

General support was expressed for the proposed style of the period / region graphic maps as proposed by Thalmann, and in particular for the method of shading and for the use of an overlay showing the distribution of key urban traits.

Agreed: that Thalmann and the cartographer would prepare a specific proposal for approval.

Agreed: that History/Epigraphy, glyptic and radiocarbon dating would be treated in the Transversal Volumes, rather than separately within each of the Interregional volumes.

Agreed: that the Interregional publication would require two volumes, one for ceramics, the second for other classes of material.

Agreed: that the list of interregional topics should be revised to reflect the following new topics. A number of good candidates for the various specialist areas were suggested by those at the meeting. Lebeau would contact the named individuals to invite them to contribute to the volume.

| <b><i>Topic</i></b>      | <b><i>Provisional Author</i></b> |
|--------------------------|----------------------------------|
| <b>CERAMICS</b>          |                                  |
| Red Black Burnished ware | Greenberg and Palumbi            |
| Caliciform pottery       | Mazzoni                          |

|  |  |
|--|--|
| Depas vessels and tankards                                       | Şahoğlu  |
| Local painted wares of the early 3 <sup>rd</sup> millennium BC   | Helwing  |
| Red polished spouted jugs (including those with cut away spouts) | Webb   |
| Levantine combed jars  | Greenberg & Thalmann   |
| Abydos ware  | Sowada   |
| <b>SETTLEMENT LAYOUT AND ARCHITECTURE</b>                        |  |
| Palace architecture in Anatolia                                  | Professor Fikri Kulakoğlu  |
| Storage facilities   | de Miroschedji   |
| Domestic Architecture  | Paz (ESL) Papconstantiou (ECY)   |
| Settlement layouts   | Rey, Tuncel (Anatolia)   |
| Tumuli and high places   | Bradbury, Butterlin, McLelland   |
| Water installations  | Braemer, Wilkinson   |
| Architectural forms occurring in marginal areas                  | Rosen (general layout), Kroll (Yanik Tepe)                                   |
| <b>NON-CERAMIC ARTEFACTS</b>                                     |  |
| Anthropomorphic Figures from Cyprus                              | Bolger   |
| Weaponry from Anatolia   | Levent   |
| Pins and personal ornaments                                      | Gernez and Keskin  |
| Stone Vessels  | Sowada   |
| Beads  | Bar Yosef, Wright  |
| Andirons   | Greenberg, Işikli (Anatolian material)                                       |
| <b>RAW MATERIALS AND TECHNOLOGY</b>                              |  |
| Laps Lazuli  | Qenet, Pinnock   |
| Gold Silver  | Powell   |
| Steatite   | Pittman  |
| Obsidian   | Rosen, Balkan-Antli (Anatolia)   |
| Technology of bronze   | Gailhard, Shalev   |
| Technology of precious metals                                    | Powell, Nicolle, Philip  |
| Metal vessels  | Biannchi; Vasif Şahoğlu agreed to suggest a candidate for Anatolian material |

Reported: that the volume would be edited by Hilary Meeks and Caroline Middleton, who, as native speakers, would also be able to check the English language.  
 Agreed: that volume authors should submit chapters as soon as they are ready to Hilary Meeks (English Editor) and Elise Devisal (Graphic Harmonizer), with a copy to the volume Editor and the Chairmen. The copy editors can work on sections for multiple volumes in parallel.

Contacts

Hilary Meeks <[hmeeks@blueyonder.co.uk](mailto:hmeeks@blueyonder.co.uk)>

Elise Devidal <[elisedevidal@yahoo.fr](mailto:elisedevidal@yahoo.fr)>

Agreed: the design for the series cover, and that this would use a different shade of grey for the Regional, Inter-regional and Transversal volumes.

Reported: that Brepols had agreed that the print run for the volumes would be 600 copies.

Agreed: Schedules for the delivery individual volumes.

Work on the volumes for both Cyprus and the Middle Euphrates volume is well under way. The Southern Levant volume is due for submission in the first half of 2012, work will start Jun 2011. The Northern Levant volume will require rather different structures for the sections dealing with the coastal and inland regions, but the editors will aim to integrate both parts as far as this is reasonable. Will probably be the latest volume, final deadline agreed to be middle of 2013. West and Central Anatolia volume – the team will set the chronological periods as soon as possible and issue a deadline for topic to be delivered during 2013. Periodization will be informed by the discussion at this meeting. The Inter-regional volume will be produced late in 2013. The Radiocarbon contribution will be provided by Boaretto and will appear within the transversal volume.

## **Detailed Programme**

### **Day 1 Thursday, March 24th, at Van Mildert College**

Welcome to the Meeting (G. Philip)

Introductory remarks (M. Lebeau)

#### **Session I: Presentations by Regional Teams**

Southern Levant (de Miroschedji / Greenberg)

A tentative estimate of the calibrated dates of the Ebla and Mari destructions (Ebla IIB1 Palace G, Mari Ville II): (Lebeau)

Northern Levant: overview of current situation (Thalman / Philip)

Cyprus (Peltenburg / Bolger/ Papaconstantinou)

Western Anatolia (Şahoğlu / Keskin / Tuncel)

Middle Euphrates Group (Felli / Sconzo / Sakal)

#### **Session II: Transversal Themes**

The Radiocarbon evidence (Boaretto)

#### **Session III Discussion of key issues arising from regional presentations**

The EA-EL-EM synoptic table

#### **Session IV Discussion of Publication issues**

Discussion of Issues concerning Regional Volumes

Comments on the Jezirah Regional Volume (Lebeau)

Setting the Guidelines for the Interregional Volume (one single volume for the whole ARCANÉ Programme): chapters, contributors, text, tables, maps for the 'Levant and Eastern Mediterranean' Region section. Selection of Specialists for summarizing topics of interregional interest in the Interregional Volume, chapters, pages, illustrations etc.

Any further publication issues including contribution to transversal volumes: glyptic, historical sources, radiocarbon etc.

## List of Participants

### **Southern Levant Group**

*Prof P. de Miroschedji (Paris)*

Prof. R. Greenberg (Tel Aviv)

Dr K. Sowada (Sydney)

### **Northern Levant Group**

Prof. G. Philip (Durham)

Dr. J.-P. Thalmann (Paris)

### **Cyprus**

*Prof E.J. Peltenburg (Edinburgh)*

Dr D. Bolger (Edinburgh)

Dr P. Papaconstantinou (Athens)

### **Western Anatolia**

*Prof. V. Şahoğlu (Ankara)*

Dr Levent Keskin (Ankara)

Riza Tuncel (Ankara)

### **Middle Euphrates**

Dr Candida Felli (Pisa)

Dr P. Sconzo (Tübingen)

Dr F. Sakal (Tübingen)

### **Radiocarbon dates**

Dr E. Boaretto (Weizmann Institute, Tel Aviv)

### **Steering Committee**

Dr M. Lebeau (Brussels)

Dr D. Meijer (Leiden)

## Breakdown by Country / Region of Origin

| <i>Country of Institution</i> | <i>No. of Participants</i> | <i>% of total</i> |
|-------------------------------|----------------------------|-------------------|
| Belgium                       | 1                          | 5.9               |
| France                        | 2                          | 11.8              |
| Germany                       | 2                          | 11.8              |
| Greece                        | 1                          | 5.9               |
| Italy                         | 1                          | 5.9               |
| Netherlands                   | 1                          | 5.9               |
| Turkey                        | 3                          | 17.6              |
| UK                            | 3                          | 17.6              |
|                               |                            |                   |
| <b>European countries</b>     | <b>14</b>                  | <b>82.4</b>       |
|                               |                            |                   |
|                               |                            |                   |
| Australia                     | 1                          | 5.9               |
| Israel                        | 2                          | 11.8              |
| <b>Non European countries</b> | <b>3</b>                   | <b>17.6</b>       |
|                               |                            |                   |
| <b>Total</b>                  | <b>17</b>                  |                   |